the Dewan Peishkar was in charge of various branches of the administration in the country, for example, the Excise, Land Revenue, etc. In course of time, the activities of the several departments were found to be very much centralised. As they developed, it was necessary to bring about a decentralisation. This kind of decentralisation becomes indispensable for a civilised Government like Travancore.

The application of the analogy of the head of the administration controlling the entire administration and deducing therefrom that the various technical departments such as Agriculture and Industries—why not add Engineering and Medical also—may similarly be placed under one and the same person is unsound. It was suggested the other day that the post of the Director of Public Instruction might very well be abolished and in his place a Secretary might be appointed. There are competent Assistant Surgeons in the Medical Department. Following the line of argument taken by my friend, I may suggest that one of them might be appointed as the Darbar Physician on a much lower pay. Similarly, I may say of the Engineering Department also. What I want to show therefore is that the proposition is untenable and impossible. Therefore, I strongly oppose the motion.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I was unable to present to the House all the aspects of the question involved in the motion. To be of any use, I think it is necessary to discuss all the sides and aspects of the question. Therefore I would take another opportunity of discussing the subject by bringing forward a resolution. With these few words, I beg permission to withdraw the motion.

The motion was, by leave of the House, withdrawn.

Motion 329.

The following motion was not moved :—

MR. K. I. JOSEPH :

329. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1·12 lakhs under Demand XVI by Rs. 100.

The question that Rs. 1·12 lakhs under Demand XVI—Industries—be granted was put to the vote of the House and carried.

The grant was made.

The Council adjourned for lunch at 1-50 P. M. and re-assembled at 2-45 P. M. with the Deputy President in the Chair.

DEMAND XVII—MEDICAL DEPARTMENT—RS. 6·72 LAKHS.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Sir, I rise to move for a grant not exceeding Rs. 6·72 lakhs under Demand XVII—Medical Department.

23 A. MEDICAL AND SANITARY—SUPERINTENDENCE.

Motion 330.

The following motion was not moved :

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI :

330. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 6,857 for establishment by Rs. 100.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Motion 331.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Sir, I beg to move the following motion :—

331. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 10,998 for Superintendence by Re. 1.

The object of the motion is, firstly, to examine whether there is any necessity for placing the Medical Department under an Administrative Board, and, secondly, whether the appointment of a foreign missionary as a non-official member of the Medical Board is a thing which could be approved by this House. As regards the first point, the Medical Department, even though it is an important department from the point of view of health, is an unimportant department from the point of view of the nature of the routine work the department has to do. For example, there is the Land Revenue Department, and the Land Revenue Commissioner has to supervise the collection of revenue and expenditure and to control the various officers under him. Apart from the routine work, he has also to sit as an appellate authority for the disposal of *puduval* and income tax cases. Therefore, it would not be an exaggeration if I say that that officer is an overworked officer. If there is any necessity for placing any department under an Administrative Board, the Land Revenue Department comes first. In Madras, there is the Revenue Board which looks after the policy of the Revenue Department, even though the functions are carried on by the several subordinate officers. From this point of view, I do not think that there was any necessity for placing the Medical Department under an Administrative Board.

Coming to the second point, the Dewan in his Address to the Popular Assembly said that the association of a non-official in the work of an important department of this State is an innovation. The innovation is well and good. But the appointment of Mr. Noble is a violation of the principle we were advocating.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : I think you must speak only about the general principle ; you must not refer to personalities.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I shall proceed without mentioning the name. If the demand raised by the people that non-officials should be associated with the work of Government is properly appreciated and acted upon by the Government, I think this is not the kind of demand which is made by the non-official side. They want to give chance to Travancore non-officials so that they may have some vested interest in the land. But here the Government under the pretext that they are carrying out the demand of the people that the non-officials should be associated with the work of the department, have appointed a foreigner, who, I must say, has no vested interest in the country. Further he is a missionary.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : What has that to do with the question ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): The appointment of a missionary to a responsible place is a thing which we cannot approve of. He is a paid agent of some institution to carry on a particular kind of work in a particular direction. Along with that, he is given a place as the non-official officer in a State department from which position he will be able to influence the people to a great extent. That is my point. Therefore, what I say is that the appointment of a non-official missionary to the Administrative Board is not in accordance with the demand of the people. The people are crying that non-officials should be taken in the administrative work of the Government. They are crying for Travancoreans to be appointed for the purpose. If that was the principle which was applied in the appointment to this particular office, what I say is that it is the violation of that principle that is adopted with regard to this particular individual. The other aspect of the question whether there are qualified men available to occupy that place in Travancore is one which I need hardly answer. There are Travancoreans with the necessary qualifications to take up that place and if their services were utilised I think it would have been cheaper. Unfortunately it happens in Travancore that the Government have some sort of indifference or contempt for native talents. In that respect also, the appointment of this individual is a thing which cannot be approved by the people.

The next point is about the Government throwing doubts whether this House would approve the appointment. Even the Deputy President of this House has his honorarium made votable. But the non-official member's pay is made non-votable.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I do not think you are in order. The decision of the Government in the matter is final.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): But does it in any way change the definition of the word 'non-official'?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: That may not be, but the Government decide the question whether a particular item is votable or non-votable.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May be. Anyhow, they wanted to remove that item from the vote of the House.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You are not in order. Section 16 (5) of the Legislative Council Regulation says thus:

"If any question arises whether any proposed appropriation of revenue or moneys does or does not relate to any matter not liable to be voted upon by the Council, the decision of the Dewan shall be final."

So, having been included as non-votable, you are not at liberty to discuss the question. The inclusion may be wrong or may be right but it is final.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I was only discussing the policy of the item being made non-votable.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You cannot say that; the order is final.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I sent an interpellation to the Secretary to the Council asking if there was any additional recurring expenditure on account of this innovation of placing the department under an administrative Board. The answer given to me was that the cost was Rs. 28-14 Chs. 10 C.

MR R. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Ag. Financial Secretary to Government*) : Per mensem.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Let it be per mensem ; that does not in any way improve matters. The total expenditure under 23 A. is Rs. 33,600 in 1102, while in 1101 it was Rs. 25,600, and, in 1100, it was Rs. 25,400. A sum of Rs. 4,000 is provided in the budget for the current year for the non-official member. I do not know whether it does not become a part of the expenditure on account of the Administrative Board. Therefore, the figures supplied by the Government in answer to my interpellation are wrong and misleading. With regard to that point, what I submit is that the appointment of a foreign missionary to a place in the Board is not a worthy thing.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Put it as a foreigner

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Is he not a foreign missionary ?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Whether he is a missionary or not is not the question in issue now. You may put it as a foreigner.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I submit to the ruling of the Chair.

I have to bring one more point to the knowledge of the Government ; that is, some nurses were dispensed with in the General Hospital for violating the rule against marriage.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : The matter is not quite clear.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : I do not know whether it is relevant here.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : This is a cut motion under the total allotment.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Under what head ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Under ' Superintendence '.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : But you are speaking about the establishment in the General Hospital.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI *Chirayinkil*) : Is it not relevant, Sir ?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : No.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : The work of the nurses is not confined to the General Hospital, but it spreads over all hospitals in the State.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : You can speak about that under other motions.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I am not directly concerned with the nurses. I only want to speak about the superintending agency and the policy adopted towards the nurses.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : The matter is not quite clear. The words 'violating the rules of marriage', are not quite clear. (*Laughter.*)

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : There is a rule saying that the nurses when they are first entertained as students should not marry for a period of five years, I think. With regard to the first batch of nurses who were trained, this rule was not very strictly applied. Now the practice is when the nurses are first entertained as students they have to enter into a covenant to the effect that they would respect the rule regarding marriage. With regard to the first batch, this rule was not strictly observed and no covenant was taken from them saying that they will strictly act up to the rule.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Is it your point that the rule should not be enforced ordinarily ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : No. But when the Government have not insisted it in the case of the first batch of nurses and they have said that they need not act up to the rules, it is something hard for—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : How can there be a precedent for wrong-doing ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Then the rules ought to have been changed. That would have been a better course. There is the other aspect of the question. I do not understand why the rule is there.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : What is the pay of these nurses ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : From Rs. 20 upwards.

MR. K. K. THOMAS (*Kottayam*) : Is there any time-limit for this demand ?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : It is nearing the time.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I do not know why the particular rule is there. Even after the services of some of the nurses were dispensed with, some nurses were appointed who had a certain number of children in the General Hospital. Therefore, I should like to hear some explanation from the member in charge as to what was the particular object in enforcing the rule in some cases and relaxing it in other cases.

I have to touch upon one other point. I am sorry I have to come to that point. But I will be failing in my duty to my community if I do not speak about that. The Medical Department is a department in which the Nairs have a poor representation. If communal representation is accepted as a policy by the Government, I do not know why it should not be accepted in the Medical Department. It is a department in which the Nairs are poorly represented. Therefore I am of opinion that more encouragement should be given to the Nairs so far as the Medical Department is concerned,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): കത്തോലിക്കാ ക്രസ്ത്യാനികൾക്ക് ആഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽ പ്രാതിനിധ്യമുണ്ടോ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I do not appreciate differences between Christians and Christians. Christians are properly represented in the Medical Department.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): നാടാന്മാർ ഹിന്ദുക്കളുടെ ഒരുവിഭാഗമല്ലേ? അതുപോലെ കത്തോലിക്കരും ക്രസ്ത്യാനികളുടെ ഒരുവിഭാഗമാണല്ലോ?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I will even accept that Hindus are not properly represented so far as the Medical Department is concerned.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Sir, Mr. Nilakanta Pillai has informed the House that he has brought forward this motion to prove that there was no necessity for the formation of the Administrative Board. Before I answer that point, I would like to ask Mr. Nilakanta Pillai what he meant by saying that the Medical Department was an unimportant department.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Unimportant from the point of view of income. I admit that from the point of view of health it is a most important department in the State.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The Medical Department does not profess to be a paying department, or a department that brings in revenue. Everybody knows that Medical Departments all over the world spend for the people and do not expect any proportionate return in money value. It is an important department, Sir, and it has got sufficient and very important work to do.

Coming to the necessity for the formation of the Board, the Dewan in his address to the last Popular Assembly has explained the matter clearly. Further, Mr. Nilakanta Pillai himself had interpellated the Government on this very subject in this Council and he has been answered. Therefore, Sir, I do not think this point needs any further explanation from me.

Mr. Nilakanta Pillai referred to the appointment of the non-official member. Sir, I remember that in the very first session I attended this House, a motion was brought forward to discuss the desirability of forming a medical committee with non-officials for reporting on the work of the hospitals. The appointment of a non-official member on the Board cannot therefore be objected to by this House.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : It is not objected to.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : It is the personnel of the non-official that is objected to at present. The Government, in the best interests of the department, selected this particular non-official member, and I can assure Mr. Nilakanta Pillai that he holds his position on the Board purely as a medical man and not as a missionary. I would challenge him to point out a single instance in which during the time the Board has been in existence the non-official member has worked so as to influence the department in any undesirable way. On the other hand, his presence on the Board has been very helpful.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Sir, on account of the ruling from the Chair, I abstained from making any reference to this. Otherwise, I would have spoken about this matter.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : I am sorry that Mr. A. K. Pillai is not here to-day to give us the benefit of his opinion on the working of the department. He was one of those who pressed strongly for the appointment of an officer to look after "the people" as he called it. The Government have now appointed such an officer in the person of the Inspecting Medical Officer. I am therefore surprised, Sir, that this innovation is not appreciated by Mr. Nilakanta Pillai. I do not think the extra expenditure incurred on account of the Board is much. It is only about Rs. 28 per mensem.

I shall now try to answer Mr. Nilakanta Pillai's question regarding the nurses. Mr. Nilakanta Pillai finds it difficult to understand why the rule was not applied to the first batch of nurses. I might tell him that it was to the first batch of nurses that the rule was applied. I was not responsible for the framing of the rule. The matter came up for consideration in Dr. Lakshmanan's time. The first letter was sent by Dr. Lakshmanan to the Medical Officer in charge of the General Hospital ordering him to dispense with the services of a nurse who had violated the rule. The matter was then referred to the Government and finally settled only later. If the President will kindly allow me a little more time, I will explain this matter more fully. This is a subject which has caused a good deal of misunderstanding and misapprehension. I would therefore like to explain it.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Yes.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : The work of the nurse in hospitals is a very strenuous and difficult one. They are posted for duty during day and night in rotation. The day duty nurse has to come at 7 A. M. and work till 5-30 P. M. and the night duty nurse is on duty from 5-30 P. M. till 8 A. M. the next day. When visiting patients in their own houses, a nurse is sometimes called upon to attend to the patient during day and night.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): What is the pay of these nurses?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The older nurses without the special training for two years are paid Rs. 15 per mensem and a few get Rs. 18. Before the reorganisation in 1098 they were getting only Rs. 12. The present nurses who have undergone the two years' training get a scale of Rs. 25-40. In the Women and Children's Hospital, I have 14 nurses, 19 female warders and 5 European nursing sisters and 8 midwives. Even with such a staff, my experience during the past 10 years has been that the work I have been able to get out of the Indian nurses has been far from satisfactory. There are of course a few who work very well. The reason for this state of affairs is that they are mostly married nurses with families to look after.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know how many of them are married?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The majority of them are married. I am referring to the nurses who have not undergone the special training for two years. When they come for night duty, we frequently find them asleep when they are expected to keep awake. Very often, they mislead the doctors with regard to symptoms simply because they had not noticed certain important things as they were too tired to keep awake. Treatment is rendered very difficult if the nurse cannot be relied upon. This is because the nurses, being mostly married, are not able to take rest during the day like the nurses in England and in the large hospitals in India. These poor women after night duty have to look after their families during the day. They have to cook the food, send the children to school and look after the household generally. They get very little rest at home with the result that they are too tired when they come to hospital for duty, whether during day or night. Is it any wonder therefore that their work in the hospital is not as satisfactory as it might be if they were free from household cares? Besides, when nurses are wanted for nursing patients in their own homes [illegible]

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I ask Mrs. Lukose [illegible] it is not possible to give such women day duty?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): No. All of them cannot always be posted for day duty. Other nurses will then have to be on night duty for months together which is very hard. Each nurse is given day and night duty in turns. There are many instances where private persons have been put to very great difficulty on account of these nurses. When a nurse is sent to a private house, it is not an uncommon occurrence for her to come with the request on the second or third day, "my child is ill and I must have leave." In some cases, I have had to change [illegible]

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

many as five nurses in a month for a single patient. The Deputy President himself has had experience of the difference in having married and unmarried nurses in cases of long nursing. I know several people in this House would also testify to this. And therefore having experienced this difficulty for some years and having found that these older nurses had not much of general education, Dr. Lakshmanan decided to improve the nursing in hospitals by getting a better type of nurses. So he drew up a scheme and with the sanction of the Government he advertised for women possessing certain qualifications to come in for training for two years. One of the conditions distinctly laid down was that they should not marry for a certain number of years. When they passed, they were to be given a scale of Rs. 25-40. The old nurses were getting Rs. 15 only. They were trained by me for two years. After they passed out and were entertained in Government service, one of them got married. The Medical Officer in charge of the General Hospital informed Dr. Lakshmanan of this and he wrote to the Government that the services of this nurse should be dispensed with. This correspondence dragged on for months during which period four more nurses got married. The services of the nurses who got married were dispensed with in accordance with Government order while I was in charge of the department.

In England and in the large cities in India, only unmarried women or widows are entertained as nurses in large hospitals. It is recognised that married nurses with limited income cannot command such conveniences as will enable them to discharge their duties satisfactorily.

MR. C. P. KOCHUKUNJU PILLAI (*Kottarakara* cum *Kunnattur*): Why not we increase the number of nurses?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The expenditure will be very heavy and we will be paying for inefficiency which is not desirable.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Government prohibit marriage only for 5 years. May I know how it improves the situation?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The reason for this was that nursing as a profession for Indian women was a new thing in Travancore. If we had prohibited marriage altogether at the beginning, not many girls would have come forward for admission into the class. So, it was thought best to prohibit marriage only for a certain number of years, at first. For the second batch of nurses, we have increased the period though I must admit even this is not a satisfactory arrangement. Girls as well as their relations are now coming to realise that nursing is a suitable and a noble profession for educated girls and in a few years' time I hope we will be able to enforce the rule more strictly without giving rise to much misunderstanding.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Does the member mean to say that Hindus are not taking up that work?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): No. I did not say that. Hindus are taking to that work. We have several Hindu nurses even now.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Does the member admit that it will be considered as a social stigma if they do not get married?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I do not know about that. If there is any social stigma, they will get over it as time goes on. In other countries, nurses are getting on very well—

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Yes, even Hindus?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I know some Hindu nurses elsewhere who are working very well. When I was in charge of the department, I enquired of the medical officers in charge of the General Hospital about the work of the nurses after marriage. They complained to me bitterly about these nurses and said that they were no better than the older nurses who had not as much training. What was the use therefore of giving these nurses two years' training and a higher scale of pay? I have with me here several instances of the unsatisfactory work of the nurses after marriage. To quote one example, there was a nurse in the Women and Children's Hospital who before her marriage was one of the best in the hospital. After marriage, she has had in about 4 years' time 29 months' leave and during the time she attended the hospital her work was very unsatisfactory. But for want of time I could quote several such instances.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): May I know what the effect of marriage on the Lady Assistant Surgeons is?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Their position is different. I am really surprised that a person like Mr. Madhavan Pillai should ask such a question. Lady Assistant Surgeons and Lady Doctors including myself have not to work in hospital the whole day or night. There are fixed hours for attendance. But the nurses have longer hours and sometimes they are obliged to work both day and night. Further, I do not think that Mr. Madhavan Pillai expects the nurses to command such conveniences as the Lady Assistant Surgeons can for the management of their households. I do not think, Sir, any woman in whatever position has a right to be in Government service if she is not able to discharge her duties satisfactorily. I hope I have made it clear why the rule regarding marriage has to be strictly enforced. The nurses were sent away not because they belonged to any particular community. A Christian nurse who broke the rule was also discharged. In the interests of efficient nursing and in the interests of suffering humanity it is most necessary that this rule should be enforced in the case of nurses.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): When a nurse has a large number of children, will it not be troublesome?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : Yes.

Sir, I would like to add that, among these nurses, we have a Brahmin widow and a Christian widow. The rule does not prevent them continuing as nurses so long as they remain single.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : With regard to the appointment of the non-official member on the Board, may I know whether he has got any other duty over and above his duty as Medical Officer ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : I do not understand the member.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): With regard to the appointment of a non-official member on the Board, may I know whether he has got any other duty over and above his duty as medical officer on the Administrative Board ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : He is not a full time officer as he is in charge of a hospital at Nagercoil.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : Is his duty here compatible with the duty there ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : It is quite compatible.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : I do not think you expect an idler to be appointed on the Board.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : Has he not got some propaganda work to do ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): He may have that; but that does not conflict with his work on the Administrative Board.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : Does not that duty imply that he has to exercise some amount of persuasion ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : I leave it to the member to answer that question.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : I believe in persuading other people to turn to his side, he may have to use sometimes arguments and reasons, and, if these things are not enough, of course, he will have to have recourse to other means whereby he can attract other people to his side. Therefore I say his duty is not compatible with his duty as an executive officer.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : You are making a speech, Mr. Panikkar.

MR. M. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : I am explaining to the member in charge—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Is it your point that, by means of persuasion, he will convert other members of the Board to his views ? (*Laughter.*)

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Not that. In so doing, he will have sometimes to use so many means which are not compatible with his duty as a member on the Board.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may say all that in your speech.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): I wanted to put a question and I am now explaining it.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: A question is intended to elicit information and not to supply information.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know the average amount of allowance drawn by the non-official member per mensem?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Rs. 400 per mensem.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Is it not possible to secure an equally competent man in the State service?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am not aware.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Does she mean to say that there is no man with equal qualifications?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am not aware whether there is any man or there is not.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know from the member what she has to say about the representation of Hindus in the Medical Department?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am sorry, Sir, I omitted that point. There has been some agitation on that matter in certain quarters. In reply to that, I would only say that Nairs are not strongly represented in the department simply because in former years they did not come forward in such numbers for service in the department as they do now. In olden days, it was the Christians who, to a large extent, availed themselves of the opportunities afforded by medical education, got themselves qualified, and sought service in the State. But now other communities are coming forward and we do consider their claims also.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Is the member aware that more than 6 Hindus, Nairs and others, applied for employment in the department and they were all refused and they had to seek service in British India?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): During which period?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Before 6 years.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): That is a long time back and I do not know exactly what happened then. But I know that several Christians from Travancore

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

had to seek service in British India as they could not find employment here. The claims of Nairs for appointment in the department have been considered. When I was in charge of the department, I recommended a Nair candidate for a vacancy for the reason that his community was not sufficiently represented in the department. In this case, the claims of Christians who were senior to him in volunteering period were passed over. An Ezhava gentleman was also recommended by me for the same reason. Here also, the claims of Christians were overlooked. Nairs are not being kept out of the department at all. But the difference in numbers between the Nairs and Christians will take some years to be corrected because, we cannot get rid of the Christians who have already been in the department many years, simply to give a post to a Nair. When vacancies arise—and they are not very often—the claims of poorly represented communities are considered. This is what we are trying to do.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know whether there are a large number of volunteers in the department?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Yes, there are several.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Do the Government propose to make any arrangement for entertaining them?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Yes, we are entertaining them as vacancies arise.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Are they not turning out a great deal of work in the hospitals every day?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Some of them are doing good work. But most of them are also learning a great deal from the hospital.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Is it not compulsory that they should attend the hospital every day?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Yes, if they want to volunteer, they must attend regularly.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): In that case, will it not be desirable to have some allowance granted to them, as is done in British India?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Allowance is not given to volunteers in British India. Qualified candidates are taken as honorary workers in some hospitals where the staff is limited. There are also some hospitals where such men are given small salaries for the work they do as House Surgeons and House Physicians. We have a large number of volunteers and it will not be possible to pay them all. Further, they volunteer in the majority of cases for their own benefit. They are enabled thereby to keep in touch with their profession. It is true that, occasionally, some of the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. M. Poonen Lukose.]

volunteers are helpful in the hospitals where owing to exigencies of service there is a temporary shortage of hands in a particular institution. But I think that in the majority of cases they get more out of the hospital than the department gets out of them.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): How many medical men were appointed in the Quilon Hospital 5 years back?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: How is it relevant?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am unable to give the information as the question is not very clear.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know how many are there at present?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): At present there are four—the Medical Officer in charge of the institution, and three Assistants.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know how many volunteers are there?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Three or four.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Will the member take it from me—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may inform her in other ways. I do not think you need supply information to the member now.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): My intention is to impress upon this House that a useful service is being rendered by these volunteers.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may do that in your speech.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I have already stated that these volunteers do help us occasionally. But, I do not think they have to be paid on this account.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I have the assurance from the member that in regard to the case of poor Tamilians even though the Government do not propose to give preference to them—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Will the case of Tamilians be considered whenever vacancies arise, is that your question Mr. Sivatanu Pillai?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Will I have the assurance that the cases of Tamilians will be considered by the Government?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): The case of Tamilians also, so far as the Medical Department is concerned, has been considered.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Sir, I have been closely listening to the speech of Mrs. Lukose by way of reply to Mr. Nilakanta Pillai's motion. I appreciate very much the significance of a non-official Committee and I am one of those who are persuaded to think

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

that there is too much in this non-official Committee. In this instance, I must confess that I have caught a Tartar. Sir, my friend Mr. Nilakanta Pillai was more or less drawing a certain inference from the constitution of the Board and also gave expression to the probable effect that it will have. I may be permitted to say a few words—

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : May I tell the member that he is proceeding on wrong data? I never drew any inference from the appointment of a foreigner on the Board.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : To make my position clear, I shall at once say a few words upon the probable effects that the Board will have. Sir, I come from a place where the non-official member also has got his permanent residence and I need hardly point out to this House that I move very closely with the people there. I believe I need not go in an indirect way to express that. There is an impression gaining ground very rapidly, among the people at any rate, that this non-official member has been understood to be a person who is omnipotent and who is also—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Don't you think it arises in all cases where non-officials come in? I think that the same may be said of a member on this Council also.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : The aspect of the question is whether it works in the best interests of the people or not. Of course, it is true that a non-official member wields considerable influence. All that I want to point out is that this impression is not in the interests of the people, but in certain instances it militates against the common good of the people. I know as a matter of fact that a certain gentleman belonging—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : I do not think we are concerned with the details of a particular individual saying that he was acting or was not acting in the best interests of the people.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : Anyhow, an erroneous impression has been created in the minds of the people that it is not to the common interest of the people as a whole—

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : How does he say that it is erroneous?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : From the Deputy President's remarks I understand that it is to be understood like that. That is why I freely conceded that point. The member in charge said in the course of her speech that the explanation for the constitution of the Board was given by the head of the Administration in the Assembly Address and in answer to an interpellation. But I should very frankly say that the necessity for a Board has not been made out by the Government. I believe and every member in this House will know that this Board is the outcome of the fickle-mindedness of the Government and the consequent inability to judge one way or the other.

MR. K. K. THOMAS (*Kottayam*) : Will the member please explain how the Government is fickle-minded?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : If the member would be a little patient, I shall explain. What I mean to say is that when the representatives of the people in this House as well as the Assembly have been in season and out of season drawing the attention of the Government to the necessity for abolishing posts, for example, certain posts in the Engineering Department, or for that matter in all departments and also to the necessity for the co-ordination of the Development Departments under one head, when all these things have been engaging the serious attention of the representatives, the people were taken by surprise by the creation of this Board. I believe not even a single individual who may be expected to be in close touch with the ways of Government affairs will take it lightly, namely the constitution of this Board. That is the first ground for the people to entertain the opinion that the Government was fickle in the matter of judging one way or the other whenever the so-called communal agitation comes up. What I would point out to the attention of this House is this. Whatever may be the position of the Government in regard to appointment or the necessity that might arise as a result of the agitation, I want emphatically to assert as the representative of the poor ryots that their money ought not to be squandered in this way. Next, I come to the point of a necessity for a non-official member on the Board. I always associate the non-official member on any committee with a certain amount of responsibility in him. I refuse to take it in any other light than this. Whenever a member is referred to as a non-official member, there is the inevitable implication that he is responsible to the people. That is how I understand it, and I refuse to understand it in any other light. I want to know which section of the people at large this non-official member represents. In the first place, as the President himself pointed out, a foreigner has practically no interest at all in this State. Perhaps out of any sense of humanitarian inclination he may be ready to look to the interests of the people of Travancore. But in actual practical life we never come across any such thing. So, with the above remarks, I wish to say and assert that the people are very much agitated about the constitution of this Board and the want of necessity for such a Board, consuming as it does the general revenue of the State derived from the people.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Sir, the subject is somewhat attractive and I fear I have myself to stand up and speak a few words in connection with this matter. The first question that has been mooted in the motion made by Mr Nilakanta Pillai is the Administrative Board itself. This Board consists of three members at present, two officials and a non-official. The need for the appointment of this non-official is the first question to be considered. My own view of the situation, Sir, is this. When two officials were appointed to be members of the Board, the Government thought that there would be room for some friction between these officers and so occasion would arise—and especially between doctors it is said that they never agree—(*Laughter*) when the question of deciding between the different views of these two officer

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

would be a problem for the Government to consider. To avoid the consideration of all such questions, the Government thought it better to have three people on the Board since two of the three people would be voting alike always.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know from the member whether he is speaking on behalf of the Government?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Let me speak and ultimately he will understand on whose behalf I am speaking. So, if there is a third member, so far as the Government are concerned, they would never be called upon to decide any question with respect to the Administrative Board, because there will be at least two votes and at least occasional unanimity of opinion among the three. It is practically therefore a resignation of the duties of the Government in favour of the Board that has been achieved by its formation.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): Does the member say that if there is only one member as the head of the department, that would also be a resignation of the duties of the Government to him?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): That is a hypothetical question and no lawyer can ever be called upon to solve a hypothetical question. If there are concrete points, then it will be time for me to answer Mr. Mammen Mappilai and to satisfy his curiosity. Now, as it is, what I consider is this. It is really a situation which the Government think would cause no more anxiety to them in the matter of deciding upon the course of the administration of the department. In order to solve it permanently, they thought that the best way to get at it was to have a third party as a non-official on the Board. Probably, there may be something behind all that. But *prima facie* this is what I think. The Government have resorted to this at the cost of the taxpayer by having a non-official on the Board.

The next objection that has been raised by Mr. Nilakanta Pillai is that he is a foreigner.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): May I know from the member whether his conception, that it was intended to do away with the difficulty by the Government, is based on any facts or whether it is only the working of his imagination?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): It is based upon facts. I do not base many things upon imagination.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): May I know what the special facts are on which he bases his opinion?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): The existence of three persons, the possibility of friction between them, all these are facts. I thought my friend was listening to me. Probably he had fallen asleep. (*Laughter.*)

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I was following my friend, but I was not able to understand the relevancy of his point.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : I can only give him a reason, but I cannot supply him with any other thing in order that he may understand me.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : Pass on, Mr. Narayana Pillai.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : The second thing that I would point out is that the gentleman is a foreigner. This is equally a valid objection.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*) : Does Mr. Narayana Pillai object to foreigners being entertained in public service ?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : Certainly. So long as there are qualified Travancoreans, I would strongly protest against the appointment of any foreigner in the State. Certainly and decidedly.

The third objection is with respect to the avocation of that gentleman in other fields of activities. Sir, I am far from suggesting that a non-official gentleman will utilise his position on the Medical Board for the purpose of advancing his own interests in other fields. I am far from suggesting that. All the same, I am submitting that the ordinary man is a man endowed with some imagination also. When Sir Sankaran Nair gave his evidence before the Public Service Commission and maintained that a Brahmin of the Pandit type, or rather a Hindu of the Pandit type or a Mahomedan of the Moulvi type should not be appointed to a post of some responsibility and influence, it was not meant that the Pandit or the Moulvi would behave himself in such a fashion as to advance his personal interests in other walks of life. It is a question of the impression of a sense of fairness in the ordinary man who will have to deal with such an official. So, irrespective of the fact that this particular non-official would be scrupulously observing the bounds and limits of his own appointment and would certainly not take advantage of his position as such on the Board, there is the possibility of people entertaining views with respect to the position of this gentleman and the avocation plied by him in other spheres. In view of that, I beg to submit that the recommendations of the Board would not carry the same weight as they would, had this gentleman not been attached so profoundly in favour of any particular line. It is in that view that the objection has to be taken into account by the Government and not that the gentleman himself is ever suspected or even imagined to misbehave. That is the third objection.

Then, with respect to the other point, that is with respect to the marriage of these nurses, I have to bring to the notice of the House one aspect of it. No doubt, Mrs. Lukose with all vehemence for strict discipline and the discharge of duties that entail on these nurses has pointed out that it is much better if they continue to be unmarried during service as it will be more to the advantage of the department. That is one aspect of the matter. Why do we first of all entertain the idea that women nurses should be employed in the hospital ? The object is that there is a certain amount of tenderness and other characteristics usually found associated with women as such. If it is a question of the rigid observance of duty alone, I fear men probably would be much better to be employed as nurses, because they can exclusively devote all their time

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

in attending to the work of the nurses, like picking up bottles of medicine and handing them over to the patients. All these things can be done very well by a man. But that peculiar charm and endearing sympathy is generally to be expected from women; that caressing tenderness inborn in women is to be expected generally from women alone. If you concede that particular aspect of the question, Sir, it has necessarily to follow that the main characteristic of womanhood, so far as we are concerned, is their amenability to marriage. That makes the woman more a woman. That makes her more tender. That makes her look with a greater expanse of sympathy upon human life. And if that is an additional qualification to a woman, I beg to submit it is such a woman that has to be preferred as a nurse. She knows the pains and troubles inherent in human beings. On the other hand, an unmarried woman not exposed to the troubles and cares in the world, who rigidly keeps on just like the male section of our State, such a woman may be found not failing, so far as the appearance to be kept up in the field of the performance of duties is concerned, but the innate sense of attachment to human beings might be probably found wanting in such a case. I do not blame anybody in the department for having enforced a Government rule. I am only bringing to the notice of the Government and not to the notice of the department that the rule requires reconsideration. With these words, I beg to resume my seat.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Sir, I also support the motion of Mr. Nilakanta Pillai. Mrs. Lukose has not convinced the House about the necessity for a Board for the administration of the Medical Department. I do not see the necessity for a foreigner to be entertained in the service, though not permanently as an advisor to the medical officers of this State. Recently, the Medical Department has been separated into two sections, the male section and the female section, and we have two very able persons in Dr. Tampi and Mrs. Lukose to administer these sections and I do not think they are wanting in capacity, knowledge or ability to administer these two sections of the Medical Department. If the Government think that there is the necessity for another person, they could have very easily found out a person in Travancore to help them. I do not think there is any necessity since these two persons are very competent. So, I strongly condemn the appointment of a foreigner and a missicnary on the Board.

About the appointment of Hindus in the Medical Department, we have been questioning the Government for the past several years about entertaining more Hindus in the department. This department has been a monopoly more or less of Christians for the past several years, and I think it is fair on the part of the Government to give a fair proportion of the appointments to all the Hindus. I hope the Government would see that they give more encouragement to all the members of the Hindu community, instead of sending them out to seek appointments in the British service and elsewhere.

I may say a word in this connection about nurses. I think it will be very difficult for Hindu nurses to remain unmarried after a certain age. (*Laughter.*) It would be a very hard thing to insist that Hindu

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. M. N. Pillai.]

girls should remain for a long time unmarried. Moreover, it is against their social custom. I would request the Government therefore to relax the rules in regard to this question and to give them concessions.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): Is it only in the case of Hindu girls that remaining unmarried is a hard thing?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I speak of Hindus, because I do not know anything about the Christian community. Speaking of Hindus, I say they ought to get married. (*Laughter.*) It is their social custom. So I would resquest the Government to see that this stringent rule is modified and Hindu nurses, if there are any, are permitted to marry if they get suitable matches.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*): I move that the question be now put.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): What more time have we for this demand?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may speak till five, but all the motions will lapse so far as this department is concerned. The motions relating to the other departments will also lapse.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Which other departments?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: There are four or five other departments.

The closure motion was put to the vote and lost.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): മെഡിക്കൽ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിന്റെ പൊതുനയത്തെപ്പററി പ്രസ്താവിക്കുന്നതിനു നിർദ്ദിഷ്ടമായ ഈ ഉപക്ഷേപത്തിന്റെ തത്വത്തോട് ഞാൻ ഏറെക്കുറെ യോജിക്കുന്നു. എന്റെ മാന്യസ്നേഹിതന്മാരിൽ ചിലർ പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിന്റെ നയത്തിൽ പ്രധാനദോഷമുള്ളതു് ഉദ്യോഗനിയമന വിഷയത്തിൽ പ്രാതിനിധ്യക്കുറവുള്ള വർഗ്ഗങ്ങളുടെ അവകാശത്തെ വേണ്ടുംവണ്ണം ഗണിച്ചു പ്രവർത്തിക്കുന്നില്ലാ എന്നുള്ളതാണു്. മസ്റ്റർ നടേശയ്യരും മിസ്റ്റർ എം. എൻ. പിള്ളയും പ്രസ്താവിച്ചതുപോലെ ഹിന്ദുസമുദായത്തിൽ പെട്ട നായന്മാർക്കു വേണ്ടിടത്തോളം പ്രാതിനിധ്യമില്ലായിരിക്കാം. ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽ ഇവർക്കു് എത്രമാത്രം പ്രാതിനിധ്യം ഇല്ലാതിരിക്കുന്നുവോ അതിലും അധികമാണു് മറെറാരു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറുകളിലും ക്രിസ്ത്യാനികളുടെ പ്രാതിനിധ്യക്കുറവു്. അതിനാൽ ആ വകുപ്പുകളിലും ഈ നയം സ്വീകരിക്കേണ്ടതാണു്. ലാൻറുറവന്യൂ, സർവ്വെ, പോലീസ്, ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറുകൾ ഇതിനു് ഉദാഹരണങ്ങളാണു്.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : അതിനെപ്പറ്റി ഇവിടെ പറയേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ല.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : അതുകൊണ്ട് മെഡിക്കൽഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിലും മറ്റു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറുകളിലെപോലെ വർഗ്ഗീയ പ്രാതിനിധ്യ തത്വം സ്വീകരിക്കണം. ഇതിൽ ചില വർഗ്ഗക്കാർക്കു പ്രാതിനിധ്യത്തിനു വളരെ കുറവുണ്ട്. പലതരത്തിലുള്ള ഡാക്ടറന്മാരുടെ എണ്ണം എടുപ്പ് ആണെന്നു ഗവണ്മെൻറു പ്രസ്ഥാപിച്ചിട്ടുള്ള കണക്കിൽ കാണുന്നു.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : എടുപ്പ് അല്ലാ എടുപ്പ് അല്ലെ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : എടുപ്പ് ആണെന്നാണ് ഞാൻ കണ്ടത്. അതിൽ നമ്പൂതിരിയും എന്നു ബ്രാഹ്മണരും എടുപ്പ് കത്തോലിക്കരും ഒരു എടുപ്പ് മറ്റു വകുപ്പിലുള്ള ക്രിസ്ത്യാനികളും ഈഴവരും രണ്ടു വെള്ളാളരും ഒരു നായിഡുവും ഒരു ക്ഷത്രിയനും ഉണ്ടെന്നാണ് കാണുന്നത്. നായന്മാർക്കു രണ്ടു പേരുണ്ട് നായന്മാരോളംതന്നെ ജനസംഖ്യയുള്ള കത്തോലിക്കാ സമുദായത്തിൽനിന്നും എടുപ്പ് പേരും അതുപോലെ ജനസംഖ്യയുള്ള ഈഴവരിൽ നിന്നു രണ്ടു പേരും മാത്രമേയുള്ളൂ. മറ്റു ക്രിസ്ത്യാനികൾക്കു കുറെപേരുണ്ട്.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : അതുകൊണ്ട് കത്തോലിക്കർ അല്ലാത്തവരെ കുറക്കണമെന്നാണൊ പറയുന്നത്?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : കുറയ്ക്കണമെന്നോ ക്രട്ടണമെന്നോ ഞാൻ പറഞ്ഞില്ലാ. മറ്റു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറുകളിലെപ്പോലെ വർഗ്ഗീയപ്രാതിനിധ്യം സ്വീകരിക്കണമെന്നാണു ഞാൻ പറയുന്നത്. എന്നാൽ മാത്രമേ പ്രവേശനം ലഭിക്കാത്ത വർഗ്ഗങ്ങളുടെ അവകാശങ്ങൾക്കു രക്ഷയുണ്ടാകൂ.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : നായന്മാർ എത്രയുണ്ട്?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : മുപ്പത്തി.....യഞ്ചു്. (ചിരി.) നായന്മാരോളംതന്നെ ജനസംഖ്യയുള്ളവരാണ് കത്തോലിക്കരും ഈഴവരും. അവരുടെ പ്രാതിനിധ്യം ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽ വളരെ കുറവാണ്.

MR. C. N. TUPPAN NAMPUTIRI (*Jenmi*) : വർഗ്ഗീയപ്രാതിനിധ്യം സ്വീകരിക്കണമെന്നു പറഞ്ഞതു മതത്തേയോ ജാതിയേയൊ അതിൻറെ അ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. C. N. Tuppan Namputiri.]

വാന്തരവിഭാഗങ്ങളേയോ ഏതിനെ അടിസ്ഥാനപ്പെടുത്തിയാണ് കൊടുക്കേണ്ടതു"?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : മതത്തേയും വർഗ്ഗത്തേയും അടിസ്ഥാനപ്പെടുത്തി ഇപ്പോഴും ജനസാമാന്യം ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടുകൊണ്ടിരിക്കുന്നരീതിയിൽ കൊടുക്കേണ്ടതാണു. അതായതു പൊതുജനഹിതത്തെ ഗണിക്കണമെന്നാണു പറയുന്നതു്. ഹിന്ദുക്കളിൽ, ബ്രാഹ്മണർ നായന്മാർ ഈഴവർ മുതലായവക്കു പ്രത്യേകം പ്രാതിനിധ്യം വേണമെന്നു് ആ വർഗ്ഗങ്ങളിൽ ഉള്ള പ്രതിനിധികളും പൊതുയോഗങ്ങളും പത്രങ്ങളും എല്ലാം അഭിപ്രായം പ്രകടിപ്പിക്കുന്നുണ്ടു്. അതുപോലെ ക്രസ്ത്യാനികളിൽ ഓരോ വർഗ്ഗക്കാക്കും പ്രത്യേകം പ്രാതിനിധ്യം വേണമെന്നു് അവരും പറയുന്നു. എന്നാൽ പ്രത്യേകം തിരിക്കണമെന്നു് ആവശ്യപ്പെടാത്ത ചെറിയ ഉപ വിഭാഗങ്ങളെ അവരുടെ ഹിതത്തിനു വിരോധമായി വിഭജിക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ല. ഏതുവർഗ്ഗത്തെ പ്രത്യേകമായി ഗണിക്കണമെന്നു് ആവശ്യപ്പെടുന്നോ അവരെമാത്രം ഗണിച്ചാൽമതി. നിർബ്ബന്ധമായ വിഭജനം ആവശ്യമില്ല. കത്തോലിക്കർ ക്രസ്ത്യാനികളിൽ വലിയ ഒരു വിഭാഗക്കാരാണു്. അവരെ പ്രത്യേകം ഗണിക്കണമെന്നു അവർ ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടുകൊണ്ടിരിക്കുന്നു. അതിലേക്കു ബഹുമേറിയ ന്യായങ്ങളും ഉണ്ടു്. ഇങ്ങിനെ വർഗ്ഗം പ്രത്യേകം എടുത്തുനോക്കാത്തപക്ഷം ഹിന്ദുക്കളെ ഒരു സമുദായമായിട്ടു ഗണിച്ചാൽ മതിയല്ലോ. അതിൽ ഈഴവർ, നായന്മാർ എന്നിങ്ങിനെ പ്രത്യേകം എടുത്തുപറയേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ല.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*) : കത്തോലിക്കരും മറുക്രസ്ത്യാനികളും ഒരുമിച്ചു് ഊണുകഴിക്കാറുണ്ടോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha* : ഒരുമിച്ചു് ഊണുകഴിക്കാറുണ്ടു്.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*) : എന്നാൽ ബ്രാഹ്മണരും നായന്മാരും അങ്ങിനെ ഊണുകഴിക്കാറുണ്ടോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*) : മത സംബന്ധമായിട്ടുള്ള യോജിപ്പിനെ ഗണിക്കുകയല്ലാതെ ഊണുകഴിക്കുന്നസംഗതിയെ പ്രധാനമായിട്ടു് വിചാരിക്കാറില്ലാ.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*) : ഹിന്ദുക്കളുടെ ഇടയിൽ അയ്യു് വളരെ പ്രധാനമായി കരുതിവരുന്നതായി അറിയാമോ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ഇപ്പോൾ മിക്കസ്ഥലങ്ങളിലും വിദ്വാന്മാരായ ആളുകൾ ഒരു വ്യത്യാസം കൂടാതെ പന്തിഭോജനം നടത്തിത്തുടങ്ങീട്ടുണ്ട്. ബ്രാഹ്മണരും ഒരുഴവരും നായന്മാരും പുലയനും ഒരുമിച്ചിരുന്നുണ്ണുകഴിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതായി പത്രത്തിൽ കണ്ടിട്ടില്ലേ?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): ഒന്നോ രണ്ടോ പേർ രഹസ്യമായി ഒരുമിച്ചു ഉണ്ണുകഴിച്ചാൽ അതു സമുദായത്തിൽ എല്ലാവരും സമ്മതിച്ചു ചെയ്തതായി വിചാരിക്കാമോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): വിദ്വാന്മാരായ ആളുകൾ കാണിച്ചു തരുന്നതിനെ വേണമല്ലോ അങ്ങീകരിച്ചു സ്വീകരിക്കാൻ. ഒരു പരിഷ്കാരകാലത്തിൽ മിശ്രഭോജനം പലേടത്തും നടക്കുന്നതായി കേൾക്കുന്നു.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): അങ്ങിനെയാണെങ്കിൽ മതത്തിലും സമഭാവന വരുത്തെ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): മതത്തിൽ അങ്ങിനെ വന്നില്ലല്ലൊ.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertaliai*): അനന്തരകാലത്തു് അങ്ങിനെ ആയിരിക്കരുതേ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ഇപ്പോൾ അങ്ങിനെ ആയില്ലല്ലോ.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): അങ്ങിനെ ആയാൽ വിരോധമുണ്ടോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): അങ്ങിനെ ആകാത്തിടത്തോളം കാലം അങ്ങിനെ ആയാലൊ എന്നുള്ള ചോദ്യത്തിന് അവകാശമില്ലാ. വർഗ്ഗീയപ്രാതിനിധ്യം മറ്റു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറുകളിലെപ്പോലെ ഇതിലും നടപ്പിൽ വരുത്തണം. അതിന് തടസ്ഥമായിട്ടു നില്ക്കുന്നതു് വാളൻറിയർമാരുടെ ക്രമനമ്പ്രഅനുസരിച്ചു ഉദ്യോഗനിയമനം നടത്തുകയുള്ളു എന്നുള്ളപുതിയ വ്യവസ്ഥയാണു്. അതിനെ ഭേദപ്പെടുത്തുകതന്നേ വേണം.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Your time is up.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): കഴിഞ്ഞ എട്ടുവർഷങ്ങൾക്കുള്ളിൽ മുപ്പതോളം ഡാക്ടർമാരുടെ നിയമനം ഉണ്ടായിട്ടുണ്ടെങ്കിലും അതിൽ ഒരു ഒറ കത്തോലിക്കനേപ്പോലും കാണ്മാനില്ല. യോഗ്യതയുള്ള അപേക്ഷകന്മാരുണ്ടായിരുന്ന എന്നുള്ളതു നിശ്ചയമാണു്.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): Sir, the Administrative Board has been brought into existence only recently and it is rather too early for the House to condemn the institution altogether. It has had not time either to justify itself or to be condemned by the public.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): How much time should it take for the public to condemn this institution?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): Perhaps it is time to condemn the Board according to Mr. Joseph. According to my own view, nobody can lay down any hard and fast rule with regard to this. There may be circumstances under which the people may derive advantages from the Board and there may be circumstances under which the Board will cause inconvenience to individuals.

MR M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): I wish to know what opinion Mr. Mammen Mappillai holds in regard to the necessity for this Board?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): As at present constituted, I think it is very desirable that this Board should continue for some time more before we could say whether any benefit to the people can be derived from it.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): He has not answered my question.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You cannot tie him down, Mr. Sivatanu Pillai, to answer 'yes' or 'no'.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): The Board contains in itself the germ of the idea of the eventual separation of the Medical Department into two branches, one for men and the other for women and children. Taking this alone into consideration, I think it would be of advantage that the institution is continued.

With regard to the idea of Mr. P.K. Narayana Pillai that the Government have relegated their functions, because these three persons can decide all questions among themselves without referring to the Government, I was surprised that such a view should have proceeded from Mr. Narayana Pillai.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): I am not at all surprised at Mr. Mammen Mappillai's surprise.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): I am only speaking for myself and I do not speak for Mr. Narayana Pillai. I say that I am surprised that such a view should have proceeded from Mr. Narayana Pillai. Each and every department is run by a single man, the head of the department, and there is no reference or quarrel in the superior administration. As for the officers of the Administrative Board deciding matters among themselves, there are certain rules regarding the matters which should be submitted to the Government, for example, the opening of new hospitals and increasing the stock of medicines.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : May I know whether Mr. Mammen Mappillai will be satisfied if two members who are in service constitute the Board ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : I am quite satisfied with the present arrangement.

MR. K MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*) : Will Mr. Mammen Mappillai consent to an Arya Samajist being appointed as one of the members of the Board ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : As a practical man, I may say that the present arrangement is satisfactory.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandurm* cum *Neduvangad*) : May I know whether the missionary will not exercise his influence as a missionary, in the department ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : It does not follow. I think the missionary does not exist there as a missionary, but he only exists as a Medical Officer.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandurm* cum *Neduvangad* : Will he not continue the occupation of converting the people into his own faith ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : He is sufficiently enlightened and educated as to dissociate his activities as a missionary from his function on the Board.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*) : Is that one of the conditions of his appointment as a member of the Board ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : The two functions must be entirely kept separate. Undoubtedly, that must have been the condition under which he was appointed. It must be assumed that it is a condition precedent to his appointment.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : May I know whether Mr. Mammen Mappillai welcomes the appointment of foreigners ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : When it becomes absolutely necessary. Anyhow the fact remains that we have got foreigners and we cannot get rid of them altogether.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Do you want more ?

MR. M. SIVATHANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : What is the opinion of Mr. Mammen Mappillai as to the appointment of this foreigner as a non-official member on the Board ?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*) : I am not prepared to drive out all foreigners even though I have strong objections to their being appointed. That is no reason why I should condemn foreigners outright. We owe very much to foreigners and it

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. C. Mammen Mappillai.]

is not at all my desire to condemn the appointment of foreigners altogether. Whenever we can avoid appointing a foreigner, we should do so. But here is a fact that a Board has been established and I am merely stating that it should be given sufficient time—

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether Mr. Mammen Mappillai approves of this particular instance?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): I have no objection in regard to this particular instance. There is no perfect institution in the world. As things now stand, I do not see any objection to the continuance of the Board.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Your time is up.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I do not find any objection whatever as regards the establishment of this Administrative Board. I should like such innovations not only in the Medical Department, but in other departments as well; only they should be carried out successfully.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Does he welcome the additional expenditure on this item?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He has only begun to speak.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I was saying that under the present conditions of Travancore, it may be commendable if such Boards are established for almost all the departments—

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Even regardless of the expenditure that it may involve?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I will speak about expenditure afterwards. So far as the work of the heads of departments is concerned, I have not the least doubt that if there are one or two persons to check their activities they will be really acting with a better sense of responsibility. In this particular case, the appointment of a non-official is commendable because we are always observing that, in administrative matters, the heads of departments and other officials are mostly inclined to act without any sort of responsibility, and if non-officials are also allowed to take part in administrative matters, it will only be a connecting link between officials and non-officials.

Mr. Sivarama Panikkar was speaking of the additional expenditure that will be incurred. If we view the matter in a wider aspect and if we have the interests of the people in our hearts, we must agree with the principle of Mr. Panikkar. But considering the conditions of Travancore, I do not think that there is any attempt at economy in the higher ranks of service. If the public and if members like Mr. Panikkar advocate the reduction of the salaries of highly paid officers, I am sure that they should be in the right. But I think that so far as the Administrative Board is concerned, the practical benefits that may be derived will not be out of proportion to the additional expenditure that may have to be incurred.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know whether Mr. Joseph was not of opinion that the post of the Director of Education should be abolished and that the salaries of the Professors should be reduced?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): That was my opinion.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Is that not inconsistent with his present opinion?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I do not think there is any inconsistency. The Education Department is different from other departments. Even considering it is otherwise, I say that so far as the Medical Department is concerned, there is not much additional expenditure. There is the additional expenditure only with respect to the amount paid to the non-official member. The other two are official members. The post of the Darbar Physician has been abolished and, instead, there are now three officers.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): If there is one person the bottom will be more safe.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): The sum saved would be only small. If any post is to be abolished, it will only be in the lower ranks.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): What is the small amount that he is referring to?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): It depends upon the pay of the officers.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Does he advocate the principle enunciated in the motion?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): As regards the principle, I say that there will be more efficiency if the matter is entrusted to the Board. Even at the expense of some amount of money, I advocate the present arrangement because efficiency as well as the interest of the public is at once ensured by this arrangement.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know whether the member is aware that even before this Board was constituted this department was efficiently managed by the member in charge now here?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Mr. Panikkar, you may question him to elicit more information. If the members of opposite views are cross-examined, the whole time will be wasted.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know whether Mr. Joseph advocates the principle of the appointment of foreigners in other departments?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I support the principle that is involved in the motion.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You have got one minute more.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): So far as individuals are concerned, I do not find anything objectionable in the appointment of foreigners. But as regards the question of Mr. K. P.Nilakanta Pillai, if one closely watches the proceedings of this Council one will be inclined to think that foreigners are better even though I do not say that I myself am advocating such a thing.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*): I agree with the statement made by Mrs. Lukose that the Medical Department is a very important one. It deals with matters of life and death. So, it is certainly a very important department. But the question here is whether the determination of the policy of the department is after all a very complicated affair. It seems to me that it is not so. Certainly, the Medical Department deals with the relief of human suffering. The complication lies only in the way in which the treatment is administered. It is the work of the Doctors that is complicated. They have to diagnose the disease and apply the proper remedy. Diseases and their treatment are complicated matters. But it seems to me that the determination of the policy of the department is a very simple matter. My own view is that, in the appointment of this Board, the Government have begun at the wrong end. If the Government wanted to constitute Administrative Boards, they ought to have begun with the General Administration. There, matters are certainly complicated. I do not think there is any complication in the determination of the policy of the Medical Department. That is my only objection with regard to that matter. All the same, I welcome the association of non-officials in the administration of all Government departments. My only objection is, as I have already stated, that the Government have begun at the wrong end. When the people asked for greater association with the Government in the administration of the several departments, their wishes were acceded to only in this particular case and that in an undesirable way. So far as I know, the demand of the people was that *their representatives* should be associated in the administration of the several departments and not that the Government should appoint whomsoever they like. (Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai, *Hear, hear.*)

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): How is a representative of the people to be elected?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: The Council may elect a representative.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*): The non-official representative chosen by the Government should have been one of the representatives of the people, or at least one whose appointment has been approved of by the people. I am not at all against the appointment of a European provided his appointment is approved of by the representatives of the people. In this matter of the determination of the policy of the department, I think, even non-medical men, provided they represent public opinion and would serve public interests, could be associated with the Government.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

I also wish to say a few words on the question of marriage of nurses (*Laughter.*) It was stated that the nurses should remain unmarried for five years. If their marriage is objectionable for five years, I do not see how it ceases to be objectionable afterwards. As Mr. Narayana Pillai observed, I think most patients are likely to prefer the attendance of staid and experienced married ladies as nurses than that of flighty unmarried girls. *(Laughter.)* Probably, that is a matter better known to medical men and women. My only point is that, if marriage is objectionable during the first five years, I do not see how it could be tolerated afterwards. There is no sense in that. I join with Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai in saying that the rule needs modification. Of course, these nurses should attend to their duties. If it is found, in the case of particular nurses, that their marriage stands in the way of the proper discharge of their duties, the services of such nurses might be dispensed with.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Sir, we have been all along fighting for retrenchment to be effected wherever possible. Here is a tangible instance in which the Government, instead of effecting retrenchment, have incurred additional expenditure by the institution of the Administrative Board. The necessity for the establishment of a Board of this kind has not been established by the Government. The member in charge of this department, while she was replying the mover, seems to have made pointed reference to the speech made by the Dewan and to the answer given to the interpellation of Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai. We have not been supplied with these papers, and, therefore, we are not in a position to say anything in regard to what is stated in these papers. I may however say that the necessity for the constitution of such a Board has not been established by the Government.

This is a department, Sir, which one man has been managing without room for any complaint. It was with profound enthusiasm that the people of the country welcomed the member in charge of this department as the Darbar Physician. (*Hear, hear.*) It is not with any personal interest that I am saying this. It is only in the interest of the country that I am now speaking. Whatever could be done by one person should certainly be allowed to be done by one person. That ought to be the principle. The special object of the Government in establishing a Board of this sort is not at all clear. I do not care very much whether the non-official member on the Board is a foreigner or a Travancorean. My only point is that, as my friend Mr. Sivatanu Pillai pointed out, so long as the member is not responsible to the people, he cannot be considered to be a non-official. He should also be classed along with the officials. I strongly object to the policy of the Government in appointing a non-official gentleman who has got several other responsible duties to attend to, over and above his work on the Board. His other works may not be compatible with his duties as an Executive Officer on the Board, and the reasons for my argument have been very ably referred to by my revered teacher Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai. I, therefore, do not want to dilate upon that. I would object to the appointment of an Arya Samajist also. Because, the non-official member, who is appointed to sit on the Board should not have any other interest

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. Sivarama Panikkar.]

in the country. His only interest should be the interest of the country. That is why I said that I have no objection even to the appointment of a foreigner provided he cares for the interest of our country. There are examples of foreigners serving our country now who try their level best to promote the country's cause. They are tangible instances which show that even foreigners could very well be appointed if only we are assured that they would promote the country's cause. But here is an instance where the non-official member has other duties to attend to and cannot, therefore, work for the country's cause.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): May I know what his other duties are?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): I refer to his duties as a missionary.

Then, with regard to the other point, about the want of representation of the Hindus and Catholics in this department, although I am not for communal representation myself, since the other members seem to urge the necessity for communal representation, I too, as a member of the community to which I belong and also as a follower of the ancient religion to which I belong, wish to uphold the cause of *my* community and of *my* religion as well. I also extend my sympathy towards the Catholics.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*): What about the Jacobites?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): If they are unrepresented, I have no objection to extend my sympathy to them also. But I do not know whether they are unrepresented or not.

Therefore, in making future appointments in the department, I request the member in charge of the department and also the Government to give preference to the claims of volunteers belonging to the unrepresented communities over and above the period for which they have served as volunteers.

With regard to the nurses, I am not in a position to say anything now. When I heard the official member in charge of the department, I was perfectly satisfied with the explanation and it was very very convincing. But when I heard Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai, I first wavered a little, and now I am more inclined to agree with Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai's view on the matter than with that of the official member. Anyhow, Sir, I think the rule has to be modified. After five years of their service, it would be very difficult for them to get husbands, since they would have, by that time, reached their twenty-fourth or twenty-fifth year of age. (*Laughter.*) I request the Government to relax that rule.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): When there are so many complaints regarding the communal partiality of the heads of departments, is it not better that the administration of, and the appointments to, the department are left to a Board rather than to a single individual?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): I am not convinced that any communal partiality is being shown by the heads of departments.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): My question is about the complaints against communal partiality shown by the heads of departments.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): I do not think there is any complaint about communal partiality. The agitation is only for adequate communal representation.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Were there not complaints about communal partiality?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He has already told you that, according to him, there was no complaint about communal partiality. You will have to take his word for it, that is all. You cannot convert him to your views.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Is it not better, on principle, to have a Board instead of one individual?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): I object to the constitution of a Board on the ground that it involves additional expenditure. On principle, additional expenditure should not be tolerated. I, therefore, object to the constitution of the Board, on principle. I have clearly stated this already.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Mr. Joseph, what is the use of questioning him. He has already told you that there is an increase in the expenditure and that therefore he is against it. You are not seeking any information from him. The information regarding the increase in the expenditure has already been given.

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Sir, I wish to speak a few words in justification of the creation of the Administrative Board, Medical Services. The Dewan, in his last year's Assembly Address, has clearly stated the object of the Government in constituting the Board. The reasons were also given in the reply to the interpellation by Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai. Mr. Sivarama Panikkar said that he was not in a position to say anything on these matters since the Dewan's Assembly Address and the answer to the interpellation were not with him. As a matter of fact, they *were* supplied to the members of this House, and it is not the fault of the Government if Mr. Sivarama Panikkar did not get them.

Sir, we all remember that there have been repeated complaints in this House itself about the inadequate touring work of the Darbar Physician.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Was it ever admitted by the Government that there was inadequacy in the matter of touring by the Darbar Physician?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I merely stated that there were complaints. The statistics furnished might perhaps

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. George.]

show that the touring work of the Darbar Physician was not adequate enough. I do not at present remember whether the Government accepted it or not.

MR. K. K. THOMAS (*Kottayam*): May I know who made the complaint?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): As I have already stated; complaints were made in this House itself.

The Darbar Physician of the olden days, Sir, had a dual function. Very often, he had to be in Trivandrum in connection with his duty of attending on the members of the Royal Family. He had also to administer the department, for which work he has to be circuiting as much as possible. It was found that one person was not able to meet both these requirements satisfactorily. Naturally, the inspection work suffered to some extent. That was one of the reasons why the Government appointed an Inspecting Medical Officer whose main function is to inspect the several hospitals in the State. I am glad to say that, after the appointment of the Inspecting Medical Officer, the number of inspections has considerably increased. It is, therefore, clear that the inspectional control now exercised by the Inspecting Medical Officer is far greater than the control exercised by the Darbar Physician of the olden days. That is a justification for the appointment of the Inspecting Medical Officer.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether the deficiency in the touring work was alone responsible for the constitution of the Medical Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I only said that that was one of the reasons which induced the Government to constitute the Board.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether the member is aware that the reply given by the Darbar Physician last year in regard to the complaints about the inadequacy of touring work, was found to be most satisfactory by this House?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: How can you say, Mr. Sivatanu Pillai, whether the reply given by the Darbar Physician last year was satisfactory to the House or not?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): That could be seen from the result of the motion.

MR. N. KUMARAN (*Nominated*): Had not the Darbar Physician promised last time that she would do her best in the matter of touring?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I am not concerned with the promise that might have been made by the Darbar Physician in past years. The Darbar Physician did as much touring work as was possible; but his two-fold duties of attending on the members of the Royal family and of inspecting the several hospitals throughout the State could not be performed to the extent desirable. That is my point.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know from the member whether, to make up the deficiency in the matter of touring, it would

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

not have been enough if an Inspecting Medical Officer had been appointed to do this work alone, instead of constituting a Board like the one that we have at present?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I am coming to the other reasons which necessitated the constitution of the Board.

MR. CHANGANACHERY K. PARAMESVARAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): Who is now attending to the medical needs of the Royal Family?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): One of the members of the Board.

MR. CHANGANACHERY K. PARAMESVARAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): May I know which is the member of the Board that is now attending on the Royal Family?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The Senior Surgeon in charge of the Women's Medical Services.

Another reason which weighed with the Government in the constitution of the Board has also been explained by the Dewan. This was what he said :—

"Furthermore, there is no disguising the fact that the medical aid to women and children is not as extended or as organised as it might be."

Therefore, in constituting the Board, the Government first of all decided to have three members, two of them being officials. Of them, one was to be an Inspecting Medical Officer going round the country and inspecting the various medical institutions and the other to be in sole charge of the medical aid to the women and children in the State.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): May I know who decides the sufficiency of the inspecting work of that particular officer? Is it the Board or the Government?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The Inspecting Officer makes a report of his work and that report is placed before the Board. The report then comes up to the Government also.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Has the Board any voice in the matter?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The report is placed before the Board. The members of the Board can go through it and express their opinion on it.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum cum Neduvangad*): Is it open to the Board to express an opinion that the inspection work was not satisfactory?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I don't believe the Board ever does that.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum cum Neduvangad*): Is it open to the Board to suggest that?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Let the question arise. Then alone need the question be decided.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): There is nothing in the rules to that effect.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The second officer was the Surgeon in charge of the Women and Children's Hospital. The idea was to constitute a separate women's service and to appoint a person as the head of that branch. Besides these two reasons, it was thought desirable to have a non-official on the Board. As a matter of fact, after the constitution of the Board, I find that the Government have found great help from it in the matter of expert opinion.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Has the Board anything to do with expert opinion?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Yes, it has.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Has not the Board to decide the policy of the department as a whole?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): When I am speaking of expert opinion, I am speaking of matters in which the Government would be greatly helped if they were furnished such opinion. Suppose a big scheme is presented by the Sanitary Commissioner to the Government. At present, the Government consult the Board about the reasonableness and the advantages of the scheme. I am sure, it will be admitted that an expression of opinion by a number of experts is decidedly better than the expression of opinion by a single individual even though he may be an expert himself.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Is the position of Sanitary Commissioner one of subordination to the Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): No. He is independent of the Board.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): How then are his schemes placed before the Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The Sanitary Commissioner would only submit his scheme to the Government. But the Government in such matters might refer the scheme to the Board.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know what is the special qualification the present non-official member has to give an expert opinion?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): He has the necessary qualifications.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): I want to know whether any special qualification is wanted for giving an expert opinion?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He must be a medical man.

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I believe the present non-official member holds a medical degree.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Sir,—

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Is that qualification registerable in England?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Mr. Madhavan Pillai, you are out of order. Mr. Sivatanu Pillai has put a question which has not been answered.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): I want to know from the Chief Secretary whether the non-official member on the Board is competent to give an expert opinion?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I do not want to discuss personal matters.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): I want to know whether he has got technical qualifications?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may ascertain that by means of an interpellation.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Is that qualification registerable in England or in India?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I do not want to discuss personal matters.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): But can't the member say about the qualification of the person? He may mention the name of the degree he possesses. That would suffice.

MR. K GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): So far as it relates to a particular person, I regret I cannot reply.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): He said that the Government have associated a non-official member to form the Board with a view—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He says he cannot reply.

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): As I said, the Government are greatly helped in the matter of getting expert opinion on medical and sanitary matters.

MR C. P. KOCHUKUNJU PILLAI (*Kottarakara* cum *Kunnattur*): Was the present incumbent, *i. e.*, the non-official member on the Board, an applicant for the post?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Not at all.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Have the Government ever tried to get opinion from two experts in State service before they can say that they now get greater assistance without having tried particular officers in the State?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I suppose it will be conceded that in a committee it will be convenient for the members to consult each other. There can be no room for any resentment. On the other hand, if there is no Board, and if there is a single head in charge of a department, he will naturally resent if his schemes are placed before another person. If a committee were to decide, I do not think such difficulties would arise.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): May I know whether the Board is consulted with regard to the Sanitary Commissioner's schemes?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): He writes only to the Government and if they want further opinion on any matter, they call for the opinion of the Board on such schemes.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): So, the Government place his schemes for the criticism of the Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Yes. Why not? Further, his schemes are referred to a Board of experts.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Is not the Sanitary Commissioner an expert on public health?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Yes.

Supposing there is the Agricultural Department. The Director of Agriculture and Fisheries sends a scheme to the Government and the Government refer this to a Board which is rather a committee of experts. In that case, there will be no objection, for it is the Board that gives an opinion and not an individual expert who gives an opinion on the scheme submitted by the Director of Agriculture. If that be the case, probably he is likely to resent. Now, in this case, the Administrative Board is more or less a committee consisting of experts so much so that no resentment could result.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): Do not the Government separate public health from medicine?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The Government would like to have the opinion of other experts also in this matter.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): How is the Board an expert on public health?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Your are digressing from the main point—

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether there is any instance when the Government were obliged to seek expert opinion from the Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Yes, there was.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Will the member be pleased to mention them?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I am not prepared to mention any specific instance. I assure the member that there was at least one instance.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may take that statement.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): In the interpellation answered in the last month, I found the answer 'No'.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: You may take the assurance of the Chief Secretary.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): It is only for information I want an instance.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He says that there is an instance. Why should you go behind that?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know from the Chief Secretary whether he is ignorant of that instance or he is unwilling to give the instance?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): When I say that there is an instance, I am expected to speak the truth.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): When the member says like that, it is something like making an assertion and asking us to take everything at its face value.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Supposing it is of a confidential nature, he cannot give it out.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Then the Government can say that it is of a confidential nature and say that they are not prepared to answer.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He has said that already.

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai said that the Government had already abdicated their functions by appointing the Administrative Board. Government's relation to the Administrative Board is the same as was their relation to the Darbar Physician. The Administrative Board has been constituted as the head of the Medical Department, and is given certain powers and functions. Beyond that, the Board has to submit recommendations to the Government. Therefore there is no abdication of functions any more than in the case of the Darbar Physician.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): May I know whether the Government have rejected the opinion of the Board? Is there any instance in which—he need not disclose it, he may claim privilege—the Government have not accepted the opinion of the Medical Board?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I am not in a position to quote instances.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): How does the Government estimate the share of responsibility of each member?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): The Board is a corporate body and recommendations come from that body.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): How is each individual member held responsible? Is it for a particular opinion or a particular action?

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): Each member by himself or herself is responsible only for that work with which he or she is entrusted. But the Board as a whole makes recommendations.

Finally, I might say that, after all, the Board has been in existence only for a few months and it is only an experiment. So far as we see, the experiment has proved a success. Such being the case, I think it

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. George.]

should be given some more time before one condemns it and before one knows actually that it has failed. I am of opinion that it has proved a success. A motion for its abolition is therefore premature. Therefore I would request the member to withdraw the motion.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Am I right in saying that the Chief Secretary stated that the two reasons for the constitution of the Board were deficiency of touring work and giving expert opinion—

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: He has already given the reasons.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): ഇവിടെ മെഡിക്കൽ ബോർഡു രൂപീകരിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതിന്റെ ഒരു ശരിയായ കാരണം ചീഫ്സിക്രട്ടറിയുടെ പ്രസംഗത്തിൽനിന്നും എനിക്കു മനസ്സിലാക്കാനിടയായി. അതു കേട്ടതിനുശേഷമാണു് ഇതിനെപ്പറ്റി രണ്ടു വാക്കു സംസാരിക്കണമെന്നു് എനിക്കു തോന്നിയതു്.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): അതിനു മുമ്പേതന്നെ എണീറ്റില്ലേ?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): അതു് ചോദ്യം ചോദിക്കാനാണു്. ഞാൻ എണീറ്റതു് ഇനുതിനാണെന്നു നിശ്ചയിക്കാൻ ആ മെംബർക്കു ശക്തിയുണ്ടാകുമെന്നു ഞാൻ വിചാരിച്ചില്ല.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): അങ്ങിനെയാണെങ്കിൽ—.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Mr. Joseph, I do not think we need go into the *bona fides* of the member. When he makes a statement, you have to take it to be true. You cannot proceed to question the *bona fides* of the member.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): സക്കീട്ടുജോലി ശരിയായിട്ടു നടത്തുന്നതു പൊതുജനങ്ങളുടെ ദേഹരക്ഷയ്ക്കു് അത്യാവശ്യമാണെന്നു കരുതി അതിലേക്കു് ഒരാളെ നിശ്ചയിച്ചതിലും രാജകുടുംബത്തെ ചികിത്സിക്കുന്നതിനും സ്ത്രീകൾക്കും കുഞ്ഞുങ്ങൾക്കുമുള്ള ആശുപത്രിയിലെ ചാർജ്ജ് വഹിക്കുന്നതിനുമായി ഒരാളെ ഭാരമേല്പിച്ചതിലും തുക്കം അഭിപ്രായവ്യത്യാസമില്ല. പിന്നെ മൂന്നാമതു് ഒരുദ്യോഗസ്ഥനെക്കൂടി ബോർഡിൽ ഒരംഗമായി നിയമിച്ചതിനു ചീഫ്സിക്രട്ടറി പറയുന്ന സമാധാനം വിദ്ധ്വാഭിപ്രായം അറിയുന്നതിനെന്നാണു്.

MR. K. GEORGE (*Chief Secretary to Government*): I wish to make a personal explanation. I did not say that the non-official was appointed for giving expert opinion, but that the Board is of help that way. I said the non-official was appointed, as stated by the Dewan, to associate a non-official in the work of the department.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam cum Vilavankod*): ഞാൻ മനസ്സിലാക്കിയതങ്ങിനേയാണ്. എന്നാൽ അതിനെപ്പറ്റിത്തന്നെ പറയാം. തിരുവിതാംക്കൂർ സംസ്ഥാനത്തു ജനിച്ചുവളർന്ന വളരെ പണം ചിലവുചെയ്തു ശീമയ്ക്കുപോയി ഉന്നത പരീക്ഷാവിജയം ചെയ്തുവന്നിട്ടുള്ള രണ്ടുപേരെ മുൻ പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ രണ്ടു പ്രത്യേക ജോലികൾക്കായി നിയമിച്ചു. അവരുടെക്രടെ മെഡിയ്ക്കൽബോർഡിലെ ഒരംഗമായിട്ടു വെളിയിൽനിന്നും തിരഞ്ഞെടുത്തിട്ടുള്ള ഒരന്യോഗസ്ഥനെപ്പറ്റി ജനങ്ങൾക്ക് ആക്ഷേപമൊന്നും തൃപ്തിയില്ല എന്നു പറയുന്നതിന് ഏതെങ്കിലും മടിതോന്നുന്നില്ല. ഇവിടെയുള്ളവർക്ക് ഇങ്ങിനെയുള്ള ഉദ്യോഗങ്ങൾ കൊടുക്കണമെങ്കിൽ അവർ ബ്രിട്ടീഷ് ഇൻഡ്യയിലും, ഇംഗ്ലണ്ടിലും ഉള്ള പരീക്ഷകൾ ജയിക്കണം എന്നാണു നിയമിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതു. എന്നാൽ ഇപ്പോൾ ഇവിടെ നിയമിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതു് അമേരിക്കയിലുള്ള ഒരു പരീക്ഷാവിജയിയെയാണ്. അദ്ദേഹത്തിന്റെ പരീക്ഷാവിജയം എന്താണെന്നു ഗവർണ്മെൻറു ചീഫ്സിക്രട്ടറിക്കുതന്നെ അറിയാൻ സാധിച്ചിട്ടില്ലെന്നാണു കാണുന്നതു്.

MR. A. J. JOHN (*Vaikam cum Ettumanur*): ചീഫ്സിക്രട്ടറിമാത്രമാണോ ഉദ്യോഗം നിശ്ചയിക്കുന്നതു്?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam cum Vilavankod*): മേലദ്ധ്യക്ഷന്മാർ എന്റെ പ്രസംഗം തീർന്നതിൽപിന്നീടു ഉത്തരം പറയാം.

മെഡിക്കൽബോർഡിലെ മറ്റു രണ്ടംഗങ്ങളും സർക്കാർ ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാരാകകൊണ്ടു് അവരോടുകൂടി ഏതുതരം അന്യോഗസ്ഥനെ കൊടുത്താലും അദ്ദേഹത്തെ വച്ചുനടത്താതെതരമില്ല. എന്നാൽ ഈ നിയമനം പൊതുജനങ്ങൾക്കു ഒട്ടും അഭിമാനകരമായിതോന്നുന്നില്ല. ഇങ്ങിനെയുള്ള നിയമനങ്ങൾ നടത്തുകയാണെങ്കിൽ തിരുവിതാംക്കൂർ സംസ്ഥാനത്തു വിദ്യാഭ്യാസത്തിന്നായി ൪൦ ലക്ഷം രൂപാ ഗവർണ്മെൻറു ചിലവുചെയ്യുന്നതു വേണ്ടെന്നുവയ്ക്കണം. ഇവിടെ എത്രയോ സമർത്ഥന്മാരായ ആളുകൾ ഉണ്ടു്. തിരുവിതാംക്കൂർ സംസ്ഥാനം വിദ്യാഭ്യാസത്തിൽ മുന്നിട്ടുനില്ക്കുന്നു എന്നു ഗവർണ്മെൻറ് പല അവസരങ്ങളിലും പ്രസ്താവിക്കയും അഭിമാനിക്കയുംചെയ്തിട്ടുണ്ടു്. അങ്ങിനെയുള്ള ഒരു ഗവർണ്മെൻറ് ആദ്യമായി ഒരു മെഡിക്കൽബോഡ് ഏർപ്പെടുത്തിയപ്പോൾ അതിലേക്ക് ഒരന്യോഗസ്ഥനെ വളരെ ദൂരെനിന്നും കൊണ്ടുവരേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ല. അദ്ദേഹം ഒരു മിഷണറി ആയിരിക്കുന്നതുകൊണ്ടോ, വേറെ ജോലിയുള്ള ആളായതുകൊണ്ടോ എനിക്ക് ഒരാക്ഷേപവുമില്ല. തിരുവിതാംക്കൂറിലുള്ള ഒരാളിനെ അന്യോഗസ്ഥമെമ്പറായിട്ടു നിയമിക്കേണ്ടതായിരുന്നു. അതു ചെയ്യാത്തതിൽ ജനങ്ങൾക്കാക്ഷേപം തൃപ്തിയില്ല. ഇ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. T. Kumara Pillai.]

വിടെയുള്ള ഉദ്യോഗങ്ങൾക്കു തിരുവിതാംകൂർകാരെത്തന്നെ നിയമിക്കണമെന്ന വളരെക്കാലമായി വാദിച്ചുകൊണ്ടിരിക്കുമ്പോൾ ഈ നിയമനം ഒരിക്കലും ആദരിക്കാവുന്നതല്ല.

വേറൊരു സംഗതി എനിക്കു പറയാനുള്ളതു് മെഡിക്കൽ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിലും വർഗ്ഗീയപ്രാതിനിധ്യം നൽകണമെന്നു പലരും ഇവിടെ സൂചിപ്പിച്ചതിനെപ്പറ്റിയാണു്. ഇതിൽ എനിക്കു നേരെ വിപരീതമായ ഒരഭിപ്രായമാണുള്ളതു്. ഏതു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിലും ജനസംഖ്യയുടെ കണക്കനുസരിച്ചു് ഉദ്യോഗം കൊടുക്കുന്നതിൽ എനിക്കൊരു വിരോധവുമില്ല. എന്നാൽ മെഡിക്കൽ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിലെങ്കിലും യോഗ്യതയുള്ളവരെത്തന്നെ നിയമിക്കണം. മെഡിക്കൽഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറു ജനങ്ങളുടെ ജീവനെ പരാമർശിക്കുന്ന ഒരു സ്ഥാപനമാണു. എല്ലാഡാക്ടർമാരും ചികിത്സക്കു യോഗ്യതയുള്ളവരായിരിക്കയില്ല.

കുറെകാലങ്ങൾക്കുമുമ്പു തക്കല ആശുപത്രിയിലുള്ള മെഡിക്കൽ ഫീസരെകൊണ്ടു് എനിക്കുതന്നെ ചികിത്സിപ്പിക്കാൻ മടിതോന്നീട്ടു അന്യസ്ഥലത്തു് ഒരു ഡാക്ടരെ ചികിത്സയ്ക്കായി വരുത്തുകയാണു് ചെയ്തിട്ടുള്ളതു്. നായരാണു്, ബ്രാഹ്മണനാണു്, കത്തോലിക്കാക്രൈസ്ത്യാനിയാണു അല്ലെങ്കിൽ മറെറാരുജാതിക്കാരനാണു് എന്നൊക്കെ വിചാരിച്ചു് ഉദ്യോഗവിതരണം ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽ ചെയ്യുകയാണെങ്കിൽ ഇതുകൊണ്ടുണ്ടാകുന്ന ബുദ്ധിമുട്ടുകളും സങ്കടങ്ങളും പൊതുജനങ്ങളാണു അനുഭവിക്കേണ്ടിവരുന്നതു്.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha cum Todupuzha*): യോഗ്യത അറിയുന്നതു പരീക്ഷാവിജയത്തെയല്ലാതെ മറെറന്തിനെ അടിസ്ഥാനപ്പെടുത്തിയാണു്?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam cum Vilavankod*): ഉത്തരം പറയുന്നതു് എൻറെ പ്രസംഗത്തിനുശേഷം ആവാം. ജനറൽ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ ചില ഡാക്ടർമാർ മുമ്മായിരിക്കും, ചില ഡാക്ടർമാരുടെ അടുക്കൽ അനേകം ആളുകൾ പോവുകയും ചെയ്യുന്നതു എനിക്കുമനപോലുമി: കുഞ്ഞിപ്പാത്തുമ്മനും അറിയാവുന്ന ഒരു സംഗതിയാണല്ലോ.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha cum Todupuzha*): ഒരാളിനെ നിയമിക്കുന്നതിനുമുമ്പു യോഗ്യത എങ്ങിനെ അറിയാൻ സാധിക്കും.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam cum Vilavankod*): ഞാൻ ഉത്തരം ഒടുവിലെ പറയുകയുള്ളു എന്നു പറഞ്ഞില്ലേ. പിന്നെ എന്തിനാണു് ചോദിക്കുന്നതു?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ചോദിക്കേണ്ടതു് എന്റെ ധർമ്മമല്ലേ?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): അതിനു ഇതാണു മറുപടി.

ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിലേക്കുമാത്രം ജാതിയോ, മതമോ നോക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ല. (Mr. K. C. Mammen, Mappillai *Hear, Hear.*) ശരിയായിട്ടു ചികിത്സിക്കുന്നതിനു ശേഷിയുള്ളവരെവേണം നിയമിക്കാൻ.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): എല്ലാ വർഗ്ഗത്തിലും യോഗ്യതയുള്ളവരുണ്ടായിരിക്കയില്ലേ?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): എൽ. എം. എസ്. എം. ബീ. സീ. എം. മുതലായ പരീക്ഷകൾ ജയിച്ചിട്ടുള്ള ചില ഡാക്ടർമാർ ചില ആശുപത്രികളിലുണ്ടു്. അവർ പ്രിസ്ക്രിപ്ഷൻ എഴുതികൊടുക്കയും രോഗികൾ ആ മരുന്നു കുടിക്കയുംചെയ്യുമ്പോൾ അവർ മരിക്കുന്നു. അതുകൊണ്ടു് ഈ ഒരു ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിനെയെങ്കിലും, ഈ നീചമായ മനസ്ഥിതിയിൽ അകപ്പെടുത്താതെ ജനങ്ങളുടെ ആരോഗ്യത്തെമാത്രം വിചാരിച്ചു് യോഗ്യതയുള്ളവരും ചികിത്സിക്കുന്നതിനു തക്കതാണിയുള്ളവരുമായ ആളുകളെ നിയമിക്കണമെന്നാണു് എന്റെ അഭിപ്രായം. ഈ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽമാത്രം വർഗ്ഗീയപ്രാതിനിധ്യത്തിനു പ്രാധാന്യം കല്പിക്കരുതു്.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): യോഗ്യന്മാരെ എങ്ങിനെ അറിയാൻ സാധിക്കും?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): ഡാക്ടർ രാമൻതമ്പിയെപോലെയോ മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസിനെപോലെയോ ഞാനും ഇംഗ്ലണ്ടിൽപോയി പരീക്ഷാവിജയം ചെയ്തിരുന്നു എങ്കിൽ നിഷ്പ്രയാസം ഇതിനുത്തരം പറയാമായിരുന്നു. നല്ല ഡാക്ടർമാരെ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു് അവരുടെ അനുഭവംകൊണ്ടു തിരിച്ചറിയാൻസാധിക്കുന്നതാണു്.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Sir, I did not say even in my opening speech that in all the departments of the State all the communities should be properly represented. What I said was that *if* the Government have accepted the principle of communal representation, why then the principle should not be extended to the Medical Department as well. If the Government have *not* accepted that principle at all, I have no case. I am always for efficiency and intelligence, not for communal representation. That is all that I have to say with regard to that point. If the Government are going in for communal representation, that must in fairness be extended to all the departments of the State.

With regard to the marriage business, (*Laughter*) I do not want to say anything upon that. The House can realise the perplexity to which

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai.]

a nurse will be driven when she is asked to choose between a married life and a job in the Medical Department.

Then, even though the Chief Secretary tried his level best to say that there were reasons for constituting the Board, I remain unconvinced.

With regard to the other points even though the opinion on this side of the House is unanimous so far as the association of a non-official in the business of the Government

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I do not think it is unanimous.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May not be. It is very difficult to arrive at a unanimity in this House.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: As everywhere else.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Yes, particularly here. (*Laughter.*)

With regard to the particular appointment, that also is not a very encouraging thing. I am of opinion that as long as there are experts or men with the necessary or the required qualifications in the State itself, or the sons of the soil, there is no necessity for the Government to go out of the way and pick from some corner one who may be a foreigner or a missionary. I object to that kind of act on the part of the Government. Therefore, I do not agree with the usefulness or the uselessness of the Board.

Then with regard to the admission on the part of the Government that the touring work of the Darbar Physician was not satisfactory and that it was one of the reasons that weighed with the Government in constituting the Board, I am glad to hear that admission. Though the Government are giving the assurance that every department is working in a very perfect manner

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: To the extent possible.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Yes, to the extent possible. Anyhow when the Government say that everything is perfect there, I for one am not going to accept it at the face value. The principle involved here is an important one. The appointment of a foreigner, particularly a missionary in any department whether as a non-official or not is not praiseworthy. Therefore, I press the motion.

MR. K. K. THOMAS (*Kottayam*): Is he aware of any instance of missionary judges?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): It is not within my knowledge.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Sir, after the reply given by the Chief Secretary, I do not think it necessary for me to say much about the necessity for the formation of the Administrative Board. Certain members have now referred in strong terms to a foreign missionary being appointed on the Board. I would say that the Government went into this question carefully and it was only after careful deliberation that the present non-official member was appointed.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): What is his medical qualification ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : He possesses a recognised medical degree.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Neduvangad*): What is that ? Is he with or without a qualification ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): He is qualified.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : May I know what is his qualification ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I believe he possesses an American degree.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : May I know the name of the university ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am not in a position to give the member the information now.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : Is that degree recognised by the Medical Council of Great Britain ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I am not aware. The non-official member is a qualified medical man. His being a missionary does not at all interfere with his work as a member of the Board. I can assure the House that he has not used his position to advance his own interests in other walks of life, nor has he converted me or the Inspecting Medical Officer or the subordinates in the office. Mr. Narayana Pillai said that it was because the Government feared there might be friction between the two official members—

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : I did not say that. I said it was a possibility.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : Yes, a possibility.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : He admitted it.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): I can assure the member that there has never been any friction between the two official members of the Board.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*) : I am very glad to hear that. But why should the Government appoint a third member ?

DEPUTY PRESIDENT : When there are two, there must be a third.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): But Mr. George said that it was because there may be the possibility of a friction.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*) : I do not think Mr. George said that. If a foreign missionary might take advantage of his position to advance his interests in other walks of life—as Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai put it—may I ask the House, Sir, whether there is not the danger of any other non-official member trying to advance his own interests or the interests

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. Poonen Lukose.]

of his community when so appointed. The Government were of opinion that the present non-official member was the best suited to be on the Board and they appointed him. I do not think any purpose is served by discussing the matter any further.

With regard to the nurses, Sir, Mr. Narayana Pillai has described the many attractions of married women at great length. All I wish to say is, if those attractions are so real, let them be taken advantage of, at the hands of persons following other walks of life. If the Hindus, as Mr. M. N. Pillai put it, must marry, let them marry by all means, but let them not become nurses.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Your time is up.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): One more point, Sir, and I shall finish.

With regard to the constitution of the Board, Sir, Mr. Sivatanu Pillai and Mr. Sivarama Panikkar pointed out that extra expenditure was involved. I think that this small increase of expenditure ought not to count if efficiency is secured. The appointment of an Inspecting Medical Officer to look after the hospitals of the State is a great advantage. He is engaged about five days every week in this work. He has opportunities of finding out the local needs. The extra expenditure after the formation of the Board is only about Rs. 283 per annum.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): That figure is wrong. I challenge that.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): Anyhow, this is the figure that has been worked out.

Mr. Raman Menon said that we do not want a Board to carry on the work of the department. He seems to think that the head of the Medical Department just exists for prescribing and mixing medicines.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*): May I point out that I said only that an administrative board was more necessary in respect of other departments than of the Medical Department?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Sevices*): But he said that the doctor's work is to treat—to prescribe and mix medicines. The old Darbar Physicians had not only to control the Medical Department, but they were also often consulted by the Government in many important matters connected with other departments of the State and with the British Government. It must be admitted that the opinion of three persons in such matters is an advantage. To quote an instance, a big amount has been included in this year's budget for X-ray installation. The Board has taken up this matter, and placed before the Government certain suggestions. I think the opinions of three persons in an important matter like this has been an advantage. Even if there is a foreign missionary on the Board, I ask, are there not also two Travancoreans on the Board—two people who are interested in the welfare of the State?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam cum Vilavankod*): ഇത ദാരിദ്ര്യമായിട്ട വെളിയിൽ നിന്ന ഒരാളിനെ കൊണ്ടുവരണ്ട ആവശ്യമുണ്ടോ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Services*): It was not thought sufficient.

This is all that I have to say against the motion.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: Do you press your motion, Mr. Nilakanta Pillai?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Sir, as it seems to be an experimental measure, I must wait for an opportunity to know whether the Board will prove a failure. I therefore do not press this motion.

The motion was, by leave of the House, withdrawn.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: The remaining motions lapse on account of the time-limit.

Motions 332 to 337.

The following motions lapsed, the time allotted having expired :—

MR. T. J. MATTHEW:

332. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 10,998 for superintendence by Rs. 5.

23 B. HOSPITAL AND DISPENSARIES.

MR. C. N. TUPPAN NAMPUTIRI:

333. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 6,30,319 for Hospitals and Dispensaries by Re. 1.

23 J. GRANTS FOR MEDICAL PURPOSES.

MR. C. P. THOMAS:

334. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 45,400 for grants for medical purposes by Re. 1.

MOTIONS UNDER DEMAND XVII.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN:

335. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 6·72 lakhs under Demand XVII by Re. 1.

MR. T. J. MATTHEW:

336. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 6·72 lakhs under Demand XVII by Re. 1

MR. A. K. PILLAI:

337. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 6·72 lakhs under Demand XVII by Rs. 10

DEPUTY PRESIDENT: I put to the vote of the House, Demand XVII—Medical Department—for a sum of Rs. 6·72 lakhs.

The motion was carried and the grant was made.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly